

CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH  
PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA  
CITY COUNCIL SPECIAL MEETING  
MUNICIPAL COMPLEX COUNCIL CHAMBERS

AUGUST 2, 2010  
6:00 P.M. - 7:15 P.M.

APPEARANCES

MAYOR THOMAS MASTERS  
CHAIRPERSON DAWN S. PARDO  
CHAIR PRO TEM JUDY L. DAVIS  
COUNCILPERSON BILLIE E. BROOKS  
COUNCILPERSON SHELBY L. LOWE  
COUNCILPERSON CEDRICK A. THOMAS  
CITY MANAGER RUTH JONES  
DEPUTY CITY CLERK CLAUDINE ANTHONY  
CITY ATTORNEY PAMELA RYAN

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

## P R O C E E D I N G S

- - -

(Thereupon, the following was transcribed from the videotaped proceedings:)

CHAIRPERSON PARDO: Ms. Jones.

CITY MANAGER JONES: Madam Chair and Members of Council, upon last week at the conclusion of our budget workshop, we were granted permission to bring back consideration this evening for setting the maximum millage for the 2010/2011 budget for the City. The last City Council meeting you had before you a resolution asking for a 1 mill increase. That item failed for lack of three favorable votes.

We had discussions and I was directed to go back and to cut the budget even further to see what impact that could have on a new millage. So right now I would like for the Finance Department to present the presentation to you and to the citizens of the City of Riviera Beach. We realize that in order to advertise our rate, we must set this maximum millage. The deadline for setting that maximum millage is the end of July. This has been our first opportunity. We have informed them that

1 we would be getting that action done this week.  
2 They reminded us that if we did not set the  
3 maximum millage, that they would advertise a  
4 millage and that millage would be at the rolled  
5 back rate.

6 So right now we have before you a board  
7 item to increase the millage rate by point five  
8 seven two. Once the staff has completed their  
9 presentation, we will answer any questions that  
10 you might have.

11 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: Thank you, Ms. Jones.

12 MS. HOSKINS: Good afternoon. Karen  
13 Hoskins, Assistant Finance Director.

14 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: Good afternoon.

15 MS. HOSKINS: This first slide that you  
16 see shows our total assessed value. As we've  
17 stated in earlier workshops, our assessed value  
18 has dropped by 15.30 percent. So it went from  
19 3.69 to \$3.107 billion for fiscal year  
20 2010/2011.

21 This slide shows our millage rate history.  
22 As you see, the last four years we've had a  
23 millage rate at 8.50 and below. Our current  
24 millage rate is 8.426. And tonight we are  
25 asking that you set the maximum millage for

1 fiscal year 2010/11 at 8.9980, just below nine  
2 mills.

3 What is the rolled-back rate. The  
4 rolled-back rate is the millage rate necessary  
5 to raise the same amount of property tax  
6 revenues as previous year, excluding taxes from  
7 new construction.

8 This is our calculation of the rolled-back  
9 rate based on the 2011 numbers. So our current  
10 rolled-back rate is 9.7628. The current  
11 rolled-back rate is calculated at 9.7628.

12 As I stated earlier, the rolled-back rate  
13 is 9.7628 mills. And this is due to the  
14 decline in property tax values of 15.30  
15 percent. And this means that the City would  
16 have to raise the millage rate to 9.726 to  
17 generate the same amount of property tax  
18 revenues this current year.

19 Previously the City Manger presented to  
20 you a balance budget, and that was at 9.426  
21 mills based on budget workshops with the City  
22 Council. You have expressed your desire not to  
23 go to one mill. So staff, we are recommending  
24 that you raise the millage rate by point five  
25 seven two. That's a point five seven two mill

1 increase to 8.9980. This is a seven percent  
2 increase over the current millage rate of  
3 8.426.

4 CITY MANAGER JONES: This millage rate  
5 increase of the point five seven two is being  
6 requested in order to not have to take  
7 additional cuts in public safety, in our  
8 library. Those areas where we have already  
9 taken cuts and recommended cuts in the first  
10 round. But that still left about -- still  
11 about \$1.4 million short of what we needed for  
12 a balanced budget. And I understand and also  
13 agree with you as much as possible, we need to  
14 try to limit the negative impact on public  
15 safety by cutting deeper as well as the area,  
16 particularly the library.

17 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: Madam Chair.

18 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: Yes, Mr. Lowe.

19 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: Ms. Jones, what  
20 negative impact? Because that's never been  
21 explained. We've also assumed that it would be  
22 a negative impact. But can you tell me in  
23 exact terms what negative impact. Have you  
24 studied it? Have you -- can you tell me what  
25 negative impact.

1           CITY MANAGER JONES: The additional cuts  
2           in the fire department would result in losing  
3           at least five to six additional firefighters.  
4           In the police department, we would be  
5           eliminating code enforcement officers and a  
6           couple technician positions in the code  
7           enforcement area, which are quite critical and  
8           would eliminate us not having to go and  
9           recommend any additional reduction in the  
10          numbers of sworn police officers that are  
11          serving the citizens on the street.

12                 So that would be the negative impact. We  
13          really need to make sure that we maintain our  
14          code enforcement. It's a critical part of our  
15          neighborhood beautification, bringing our  
16          neighborhoods back, and plays a critical role  
17          in how we're perceived how safe we are. And  
18          that we're not the dumping ground and that we  
19          take care of our neighborhoods.

20                 So for further cuts in code enforcement,  
21          for further cuts in police officers, to  
22          eliminate further cuts of fireman as well as we  
23          only have five -- well, six, one's on leave,  
24          filled positions in our library. To take  
25          another position from the library that services

1           our residents and particularly our students,  
2           and this is the only library they've got, that  
3           it would be a negative impact in that we would  
4           have to reduce the number of hours or try to  
5           find other ways to accommodate our children.  
6           And I just -- those are some of the negative  
7           impacts.

8           COUNCILPERSON LOWE:   So the negative  
9           impact would be basically what I'm hearing is  
10          just a loss of jobs.   Because it's a negative  
11          impact if we lose public workers and everybody  
12          else.   That's negative.

13          CITY MANAGER JONES:   Yes.

14          COUNCILPERSON LOWE:   But, you know,  
15          negative is you know -- it's just right now  
16          it's subjective.   Because as I've been saying  
17          in the earlier meetings, you know, I can't see  
18          it.   I don't have any data in front of me, no  
19          numbers.   I don't know how well the police  
20          department is doing or fire.   I can see the  
21          deficiencies when I ride up Blue Heron and it's  
22          all weeded up and stuff.   Those kind of things  
23          I can see.   But the other negative impacts, you  
24          know, I just want something I can see and  
25          verify.   But we can move on.

1 COUNCILPERSON BROOKS: Madam Chair.

2 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: Yes, Ms. Brooks.

3 COUNCILPERSON BROOKS: I'm going to ask  
4 Ms. Jones. With this amount of revenue to go  
5 along with this, are you saying that there will  
6 not be a need to reduce personnel in the fire  
7 department? I know there were like six --

8 CITY MANAGER JONES: Any further than what  
9 has already been recommended.

10 COUNCILPERSON BROOKS: I see. So the six  
11 still remains the same.

12 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: Well, I'll make a  
13 comment. I don't like the fact that we're  
14 dangling these -- you know, we're dangling  
15 public safety in front of our residents and  
16 saying, you know, once again we're putting it  
17 on your backs. You as a tax payer, you are  
18 residents, are tax payers. And I think first  
19 and foremost they deserve and they expect  
20 public safety. And to tell them that if you  
21 don't go along with raising the millage, that  
22 there's a chance that we're cutting back on  
23 public safety. And also, you know, the  
24 library. I think what we're doing right here  
25 is we're trying to tug at, you know, their

1 heart. You know, with the library -- well,  
2 okay, instead of cutting the library, why don't  
3 you charge, you know, a dollar for the pool,  
4 you know.

5 So to say, well, if you want to keep your  
6 library open and, you know, an extra employee  
7 on board, we're going to have to raise the  
8 millage, you know, no. And one other thing  
9 that we need to remember. There's a lot of  
10 seniors in our community on the island and over  
11 here on the west side who pay taxes. And  
12 please remember that those seniors did not get  
13 their cost of living from Social Security this  
14 year. And the City was able to, you know, try  
15 to help them out with their water bill.  
16 Because so many came in and said they couldn't  
17 afford it.

18 So then to turn around and say, okay,  
19 we're helping you with your water bill, but now  
20 to make sure that you have public safety, we're  
21 going to raise your millage. You know, it's  
22 just -- when does it stop? You know, when does  
23 it stop?

24 CITY MANAGER JONES: It was not and is  
25 never easy to recommend a budget -- I mean a

1 tax increase ever. But when public safety  
2 constitutes 51 percent of your budget --

3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: More than that.

4 CITY MANAGER JONES: -- there is no way  
5 that it cannot be one of the factors considered  
6 in any budget reduction or in a millage  
7 increase. It's 51 percent of your budget.

8 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: No, I understand that.  
9 Right. But it's always public safety. That's  
10 the first thing. We're going to cut public  
11 safety. We're going to cut, you know, how many  
12 police officers. We're going to cut a dozen  
13 firefighters. You know, what are we paying  
14 taxes for then? What are we paying taxes for?

15 CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: Madam Chair.

16 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: Yeah, Ms. Davis.

17 CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: Every other  
18 municipality in this country is looking at  
19 doing the exact same things that we're doing.  
20 They are cutting personnel, including fire and  
21 police in staggering numbers. So in my opinion  
22 surly everybody can't be wrong in doing the  
23 same thing. And I have never ever said at any  
24 time that fire and police had to be first.  
25 And, you know, I think -- and, you know, I

1 don't want to go there, but I think it's  
2 necessary.

3 Last year when we knew we were going to  
4 be -- when we knew we were going to have to  
5 look at this, we did just the opposite of what  
6 we should have been doing. So, you know, here  
7 we are, we're down to the crunch now. And as  
8 I've said before, and I'll probably be written  
9 up in the papers again saying, oh, I voted to  
10 increase taxes. But I'm doing my job. I'm  
11 doing what you elected me to do. Make those  
12 tough decisions. And to talk about if we don't  
13 do anything the County is going to do it for  
14 us. I think that's absolutely ridiculous and  
15 it's embarrassing to allow the County to do  
16 your job, you know, our job. What we're  
17 sitting here we're supposed to be doing.

18 So I think to even think that way is the  
19 wrong road to be going down. And I understand  
20 my colleague's concerns about public safety. I  
21 do. I really, really do. I love my  
22 firefighters. I love my police officers. Even  
23 though some of them may not love me. But I'm  
24 going to do my job. That's just the bottom  
25 line. And I think all of us up here, you know,

1           you were elected to do your job and that's what  
2           we should all be doing.

3           CHAIRPERSON PARDO: I just want to make a  
4           comment. Just because oath municipalities are  
5           raising taxes doesn't mean --

6           CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: I'm not debating you  
7           Ms. Pardo.

8           CHAIRPERSON PARDO: I'm not debating you  
9           either. Just because they're raising taxes  
10          doesn't mean that it's the right thing to do.  
11          And also, what's going to happen next year? If  
12          we're going to raise our taxes, we're going to  
13          go up to nine and a half mills. What's going  
14          to happen next year? Because things aren't  
15          going to be any better. So we're going to be  
16          at the same point next year only able to raise  
17          the millage by a half a mill and then we're  
18          going to be capped out by 10 mills. What's  
19          going to happen then? It's going to be back to  
20          well it's public safety. We're going to have  
21          to layoff public safety and we're going to have  
22          to layoff the library. You know, this year we  
23          should have -- and we spoke about it last year.  
24          We were going to go in and we were going to  
25          take a look at some of the pensions. We were

1 going to do things and unfortunately those  
2 things weren't done. So here we are a year  
3 later and it looks like it's going to be, you  
4 know, the tax payers out there taking the brunt  
5 of it.

6 CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: And one more thing  
7 regarding the pensions. That is an ongoing  
8 process. It would not have been completed by  
9 the time we were to make this decision. As you  
10 and I both know, all of us up here know, unions  
11 are not -- their goal is not to give in on  
12 anything. Their goal is to maintain as many  
13 benefits as they possibly can. And, you know,  
14 it's not something that you can just take away  
15 just like that. It just doesn't happen.

16 So I think that's a mute point. I was  
17 reading something from Lake Worth. They are in  
18 the process, but they still haven't completed  
19 it, you know. So it's not something that you  
20 can just do just like that.

21 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: Right. They're in the  
22 process. We're not even in the process. We  
23 haven't even started the process.

24 CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: I believe we did,  
25 didn't we? Yes.

1 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: Mr. Thomas.

2 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Ms. Williams. I'm  
3 sorry, Ms. Hoskins. I'm marrying the two of  
4 you all. I do apologize. Nice guy though.  
5 Nice guy.

6 If a home is purchased for let's say  
7 \$40,000, how much tax money do we get from that  
8 home right now?

9 MS. HOSKINS: Do you mind if I go to that  
10 slide? I have it as part --

11 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Yes.

12 MS. HOSKINS: At 40 --

13 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Keeping in mind  
14 that we have a double homestead exemption.

15 MS. HOSKINS: Right. You don't have the  
16 homestead exemption that you can put on there.

17 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: If it's 40, I mean  
18 I think that's very easy to say. Because you  
19 can go up to 50,000 for your homestead  
20 exemption, correct?

21 MS. HOSKINS: Correct. Homestead  
22 exemption is 50.

23 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Right. So if the  
24 City or if it's now 26 homes that were  
25 purchased for under \$40,000 in the past 60

1 days, that means that we're not going to  
2 realize any tax revenue from those homes. And  
3 as I was looking at this, there are a lot of  
4 homes that when that double tax exemption came  
5 in, that they kind of so to speak Riviera Beach  
6 taxes. They went off the tax roll because they  
7 didn't have a responsibility anymore to the  
8 City of Riviera Beach in terms of taxes.

9 So if the homes are now valued less and  
10 we're getting less, the homes that are valued  
11 up under the homestead exemption amount, it  
12 doesn't seem as if we're going to ever realize  
13 any Riviera Beach taxes for those. Is there  
14 some type of plan that we have to see if we're  
15 going to be able to realize some taxes?

16 MS. HOSKINS: No, that would have to go  
17 through, you know, the state legislature to,  
18 you know, approve that. And I don't know of  
19 anything --

20 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: That's pending.  
21 Right.

22 MS. HOSKINS: -- that's pending.

23 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Because I don't  
24 know of anything that's pending either. And we  
25 have a lot of extra growth that went into the

1 City along the Military Trail corridor, along  
2 the Congress corridor that takes a great amount  
3 of public safety, you know, to be able to cover  
4 the needs of that. If we raise this point five  
5 seven two increase, the millage rate would be  
6 stead fast at 8.998.

7 MS. HOSKINS: Correct.

8 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: And in that 8.998,  
9 I know that there's going to be more than fire  
10 and police saved on that. What other benefits  
11 do we get from taking it up a half a mill or a  
12 little over a half a mill?

13 MS. HOSKINS: Well, as Ms. Jones  
14 mentioned it would save library. I think we  
15 had an additional cut in the library. I think  
16 it was purchasing, the mail courier. It would  
17 save that position. And a small amount in the  
18 legislative budget. Originally we were looking  
19 at your budget. So we did save some items in  
20 you all's budget.

21 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Well, I remember a  
22 couple of budget sessions ago I asked the  
23 Director of Public Works who I don't see at  
24 this time -- I see you Mr. William, but I don't  
25 see Mr. Keme. And I asked -- at that time he

1           said that he was cutting a crew. And I asked  
2           if we would still be able to maintain the level  
3           of service. And I'm speaking of this because I  
4           heard my colleague ask about, you know, the way  
5           that the streets are going to look or however.  
6           And he told this board that he would able to  
7           maintain the service. Would that point half of  
8           a mill be able to save some of that crew that  
9           would be otherwise deleted from that budget?

10           MS. HOSKINS: Initially it was not part  
11           of it. But if it's your desire to save some of  
12           that crew, then we would have to go back and  
13           re-work the numbers.

14           CITY MANAGER JONES: You can put them in  
15           there. You can do it. You can re-work the  
16           numbers.

17           COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Okay. Okay. My  
18           issue is that I've been looking over several  
19           documents here and I think that some tweaking  
20           could help. I know that some of the larger  
21           numbers that I was looking at was the deficit  
22           to the Barracuda Bay. And I saw that some  
23           small adjustments, maybe adding a fee. Maybe  
24           taking it from four days to three days could  
25           save some enormous amounts of money. And what

1 I'm asking is have our staff, the City Manger  
2 and her staff gotten a chance to actually look  
3 at those and see what they could implement to  
4 see if we needed to adjust this at all either  
5 up or down. I mean has that taken place at  
6 all?

7 CITY MANAGER JONES: Department heads have  
8 been asked to look at all areas where we can  
9 increase revenue, whether that's through our  
10 events and activities, whether it's through our  
11 fee structure, whether it can be through new  
12 initiatives. The police department is  
13 preparing to bring forth red light cameras. So  
14 they are looking at ways in order to bring in  
15 more revenue across the board, not just in this  
16 particular one. But the department is here to  
17 answer any questions that you might have about  
18 any of the particular areas. But because we  
19 know next year is going to be just as bad or  
20 worse, our efforts next year and well for the  
21 remainder of this year is increasing revenue.

22 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Well, my issue is  
23 that if you're saying -- and we were talking  
24 about public safety at that particular time.  
25 We provide ALS service, advanced life support

1 service and transport services, not just for  
2 our City that is a cost. And we also provide  
3 for the Town of Palm Beach Shores, correct?

4 CITY MANAGER JONES: Yes, sir.

5 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: And that is a  
6 source of revenue that comes in. Okay. If we  
7 were to not raise the tax to be able to save  
8 those additional jobs that would be lost in our  
9 fire department, how would that affect that  
10 particular revenue source?

11 CITY MANAGER JONES: The revenue source  
12 from the ALS service could possibly have to be  
13 adjusted upward. Because you've got to balance  
14 out what you're not getting. It's one way to  
15 do that.

16 We looked at whether we would save  
17 anything by just giving up the ALS transport.  
18 First responder, but not transport. One of the  
19 things as it related to that, we would not be  
20 able to control at all the cost that that  
21 transporting company would charge our  
22 residents. They could charge whatever they  
23 would desire, which would have greater negative  
24 impact on those that needed to use that  
25 service.

1 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: I believe I'm  
2 getting at if we don't -- if we don't -- if the  
3 employee -- if we don't have that number of  
4 employees in our fire department to be able to  
5 offer the service, I mean could we still offer  
6 it with the lost? Maybe the department head  
7 needs to answer if he's here. Would that cause  
8 us to not be able to provide that service  
9 anymore?

10 CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: Mr. Perry is here.

11 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: One of the chiefs  
12 is fine.

13 CHIEF LEDUC: Good evening. Peter LaDuc,  
14 Deputy Fire Chief. To be clear, could you  
15 restate that so I can understand.

16 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: If we left the  
17 millage at 8.426, and we would have to increase  
18 the already -- because the firefighters that  
19 are in that first round of cuts, those are life  
20 bodies, right?

21 CHIEF LEDUC: That's correct. That's  
22 currently at six.

23 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Six live bodies.  
24 And if we don't raise the millage at all, how  
25 many additional bodies would be cut?

1 CHIEF LEDUC: It was an additional five.

2 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: So 11 firefighters.

3 So if we took 11 firefighters from our  
4 department, would we still be able to have the  
5 advanced life support service that we provide  
6 at this time?

7 CHIEF LEDUC: Looking at it, staff looked  
8 at it, and the quick answer would be yes.

9 However, it is very difficult to maintain the  
10 same level of service to the citizens if we  
11 have less units available to provide the  
12 transport. So if we're transporting a patient  
13 to the hospital and we're reduced by our 11  
14 personnel, that means we may not be able to  
15 staff all the units that we currently staff.

16 So when we do a transport, that unit is  
17 out of service, and then there's no one or a  
18 limited amount to back that particular unit up  
19 to then respond to another emergency, whether  
20 it be in this city or to provide the one to  
21 Shores. So it was looked at, that we need to  
22 provide our core transport services, our  
23 current emergency services first to the  
24 citizens of Riviera Beach.

25 And so that equation becomes difficult

1 when you have lessor units to provide the  
2 transport. We would do everything that we  
3 could to maintain it. It would increase  
4 response times. It would maybe increase mutual  
5 aid where you would have outside agencies  
6 coming in to provide the service and getting  
7 that transport cost for the citizens of our  
8 community.

9 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Can you hang on  
10 just one second please and let me just finish  
11 my line. Okay. Just one second. Let me just  
12 ask this question.

13 I was under the assumption, and please  
14 make it clear, that with these 11 cuts, that  
15 this would also affect in a fire station  
16 somewhere in this particular city. Is that  
17 information true?

18 CHIEF LEDUC: In order to maintain the  
19 current level of service, with the reduction of  
20 11 firefighters, it would be very difficult to  
21 maintain a presence at each of the firehouses  
22 in the City, that's correct.

23 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: I probably just  
24 want to know whether you're going to close a  
25 fire station down.

1 CHIEF LEDUC: That is still under  
2 evaluation. And it really depends on the  
3 decisions made here tonight. And then we go  
4 back and look at to see how we could staff each  
5 of the firehouses, if we have available  
6 manning. Depending on who is on vacations  
7 those days, depending who is on a Kelly Day or  
8 who calls in sick affects the minimal staffing  
9 available to put in the firehouses each day.  
10 So it would be a fluctuation. It's not a hard  
11 answer.

12 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: I need to have that  
13 information to aid me in making that decision.  
14 You know, if you're telling me that we can  
15 still function with all of our fire stations  
16 open and not have to -- and not still have to  
17 mess with the millage, then that's one thing.  
18 But if you're saying no, then that's something  
19 that this whole board needs to know. And I  
20 know that Councilman Lowe want to talk about  
21 level of service, but I would like to  
22 definitely hear that.

23 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: What the Deputy Chief  
24 is trying to say 'is that we have four fire  
25 stations that are open. Once you start cutting

1 personnel, if you start cutting 11 fire  
2 personnel or 11 personnel, you cannot staff all  
3 those units every day. So when you get down to  
4 a level where you don't have enough staffing  
5 available, yes, there could be days we might  
6 have to consider closing a station. Do we want  
7 to do it? Absolutely not. But if you don't  
8 have enough staffing to put in each particular  
9 unit, then you have to do something. So that's  
10 what he's saying.

11 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Well, how many days  
12 do you think that we will go without all of our  
13 fire stations operating?

14 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: Well, that's hard for  
15 me to dictate, to give you that information.  
16 First of all, if you cut the 11, then you got  
17 to understand you still have to budget for  
18 vacation time, sick time, Kelly Day time. So  
19 it's more than just 11 personnel, how many per  
20 day will be off. So you still have to cover  
21 for those leave days. So I can't tell you.  
22 Right now we maintain a minimum of 17 personnel  
23 on duty every day. When we do that, we might  
24 go down like 14 or 15. So that's four or five  
25 people that are not on duty. So that's trying

1 to make a determination on how we're going to  
2 staff our units.

3 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: So when that goes  
4 down, you're just going to say well today we're  
5 not going to operate station four or today  
6 we're not going to operate station one.

7 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: Not necessarily  
8 station. We'll say we might have to take  
9 rescue three out of service or we might have to  
10 take rescue four. The alternative to that  
11 would be to hold overtime. And you don't want  
12 to hold overtime because it's going to get into  
13 a large amount of money which costs a lot.

14 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: What is our time  
15 for response right now?

16 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: We average about a five  
17 minute response time. And I remember what  
18 Councilperson Lowe was saying as far as the  
19 numbers. What happens is this. If you have  
20 four rescue trucks that are on duty every day  
21 and we're busy. So if you cut it down to two  
22 or three and a third call comes in, then we  
23 don't have a rescue vehicle, then the response  
24 time is going to be longer because you're going  
25 to have to have a unit coming from maybe Palm

1 Beach County, West Palm, or other units coming  
2 from other jurisdictions. So that's the impact  
3 when you have less staffing. So they're real  
4 numbers. When you don't have the bodies, you  
5 can't put the bodies on the vehicles. So  
6 that's the real impact.

7 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: I'll talk about  
8 police after.

9 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: Well, you kind of  
10 answered some of it. But, you know, I just  
11 wanted to know how the level of service was  
12 measured and, you know, what was last years  
13 measure -- level of service. Your trends and  
14 how you're running and the affect, you know,  
15 the actual data affect that it would --

16 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: Well, I can go back for  
17 years, but just to give you a little bit of  
18 information about it. About four or five years  
19 ago when the City Council approved additional  
20 money in overtime to keep fire station number  
21 four up and running because we didn't have the  
22 money to staff it. So we would hold overtime  
23 to make sure we had at least three or four  
24 personnel out there at all times. We establish  
25 a minimum staffing of 17 personnel every day,

1 we try to keep on duty every day. The  
2 County -- there's a County standard that says  
3 you have to have at least 11 personnel on duty  
4 every day. We can always go down to the County  
5 staffing. However, we're so busy that we'll  
6 never keep up. So that's why we establish a  
7 minimum staffing, which is really not enough of  
8 17. We can do the job because we have four  
9 fire stations in the community. But as far as  
10 the calls and getting to the calls and making  
11 sure we have additional units available, that's  
12 the issue. So we establish 17 minimum staffing  
13 of personnel. And when you start to reduce  
14 that, that's when you're getting in to response  
15 times. And I'm not saying every call is going  
16 to have a problem with response time. What I'm  
17 saying is those multiple calls and those calls  
18 that require additional units or, you know,  
19 structure fire. You're trying to get 11 or 12  
20 people there and you have somebody on a rescue  
21 call, well you're taking units from everywhere  
22 trying to make up this compliment of personnel  
23 to try to put out a structure fire. You got a  
24 train coming, a house on this side. These  
25 units can't get over here. So you got these

1 units over here trying to put out a structure  
2 fire and somebody out west at a rescue call.  
3 So it varies. I can't give you an actual  
4 number. But when you start taking away bodies,  
5 you're taking away people off of units.

6 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: You made the comment  
7 that we're so busy.

8 CITY MANAGER JONES: That's it. In  
9 numbers, what is your average monthly, annual  
10 calls? Has there been an increase, decrease?

11 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: I don't have the  
12 numbers in front of me, but we run about five  
13 or 6,000 rescue calls in a city of eight square  
14 miles and 30 some thousand people, which is a  
15 lot.

16 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: That's for the year?

17 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: Yes. That's just  
18 rescue calls. I'm not talking about structure  
19 fires. So what I'm saying remember when we  
20 respond to a call, we take the patient to the  
21 hospital. And then by the time they get back,  
22 that's like an hour. Because, you know, you  
23 go. You have some type of rescue call. You  
24 take the patient to the hospital. And by the  
25 time you get back in service, that's about an

1 hour, hour and 15 minutes, 20 minutes. We have  
2 calls that require three or four rescue truck  
3 on one call. One car accident, you  
4 could have -- remember you got two cars or  
5 three cars, you could have three or four rescue  
6 trucks out there just like that to take  
7 patients to the hospital.

8 So I mean the wait -- also you got to look  
9 at the wait, the number of calls we run and the  
10 type of calls that we run also. So when he  
11 said, yeah, we can always reduce staffing. But  
12 at some point something has to give. You can't  
13 be every place all the time. And it's no  
14 different than the police. Same exact thing  
15 when we start cutting staffing.

16 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: The revenue source  
17 that we get from Palm Beach Shores, how much do  
18 we actually get from Palm Beach Shores?

19 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: I can't say off the top  
20 of my head. I think we get like two hundred  
21 and something thousand dollars for EMS and  
22 another 80 for just fire standby. And then we  
23 also get money when we transport also.

24 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: That's annually?

25 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: Yes, sir. So any time

1 we transport a patient to the hospital, we bill  
2 the patient and we get that income. So that's  
3 another 30 or \$40,000 a year.

4 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: And that's already  
5 a direct budget line or does that go to the  
6 general fund? Where does that money go to?

7 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: It goes to the general  
8 fund. We generate -- in fire rescue we  
9 generate about a million dollars a year in  
10 revenue.

11 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Okay. And if we  
12 were not to do that anymore, our general fund  
13 would suffer even more obviously.

14 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: Absolutely. Remember  
15 when we first went into ALS staffing in Palm  
16 Beach Shores, we put no additional staffing on.  
17 We agreed fire rescue would, you know, take it  
18 on and we did. We put no additional staffing.  
19 What we did do is change the status of one of  
20 our vehicles at fire station number three and  
21 make it what's called an ALS pumper. That  
22 means that they're able to provide advanced  
23 life support services when they first arrive on  
24 the scene. They can't transport the patient to  
25 the hospital, but they can stop there and give

1 the same life saving treatment until the  
2 ambulance rescue truck gets there.

3 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: So if we cut 11  
4 bodies, we're going to still be able to raise  
5 that source of revenue that we so desperately  
6 need and still be able to maintain a level of  
7 service just with a higher response time?

8 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: Probably not, because  
9 you won't be able to transport for all the  
10 calls. You're going to have to have some  
11 mutual aid from Palm Beach County or West Palm.  
12 We need you to respond to whatever address and  
13 transport the patient to the hospital, because  
14 we don't have enough units. So probably not.  
15 And when you say acceptable level of service, I  
16 mean we feel right now acceptable level of  
17 service is 17. That's just the bare minimum of  
18 trying to keep all the units on scene in  
19 service.

20 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: The amount from Palm  
21 Beach Shores though, that's a fixed amount?

22 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: No. It has an  
23 escalator cause every year. We get three  
24 percent additional every year since we started  
25 the contract, correct.

1 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: Right. But if you  
2 got rid of 11 workers, you'd still get that  
3 contractual value from that --

4 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: As long as we  
5 maintain --

6 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: -- in the level of  
7 service clause?

8 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: I believe -- I just  
9 can't remember off the top, but we did agree to  
10 have a rescue truck over in the fire station on  
11 Singer Island.

12 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: You would still have  
13 a rescue truck over there?

14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Not necessarily. I  
15 can't sit up here and say that when you reduce  
16 11 personnel, and with all the approved leaves,  
17 I can't say which vehicles. Now when we start  
18 looking at the slower stations, which would be  
19 fire station number four, fire station number  
20 three.

21 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Where are they?

22 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: Fire station number  
23 four is the slowest. It's probably on Military  
24 Trail. But remember that's a long run if we  
25 had to go to fire station number two on Kennedy

1 all the way out there. Then we start talking  
2 about fire station number three on Singer  
3 Island. They're probably the next less busy  
4 station. Then here at station one and then  
5 station two over by Kennedy.

6 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: In Councilperson  
7 Thomas district. You can go ahead and say it.

8 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: I didn't say it.

9 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Because my  
10 constituency are not going for that.

11 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: And neither are mine.

12 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: They're all our  
13 constituents. So I don't know where that comes  
14 from.

15 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: That's right.

16 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Because that's my  
17 district. Well, I'm saying it because I'm a  
18 councilperson. My constituency are not going  
19 for that.

20 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: Don't get offended.  
21 I made a point of fact.

22 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: I am offended. I'm  
23 going to move on to my other line of  
24 questioning here. I don't think that any fire  
25 station should close, but I'm definitely you

1 know not willing to have it rumored or it being  
2 thought about that that station would close.  
3 It's in the heart of the City. You know, I  
4 just can't see, you know, how we would be able  
5 to function without that particular station.  
6 So that's why I'm asking these questions here.  
7 And regardless of what anybody else feels, I  
8 want the public to hear exactly, you know, what  
9 goes on if we don't. I just want to make sure  
10 that that's clear. If we take away 11 bodies,  
11 something is going to change drastically.

12 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: Correct.

13 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: I need the public  
14 to hear you say that if we don't.

15 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: That's correct.

16 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Something is going  
17 to change. And you just said that you may not  
18 be able to keep up a fire station.

19 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: And I prefer to say we  
20 will have to take units out of service. What I  
21 mean by that, daily depending on how many  
22 people show up for work today. If we don't  
23 hold overtime to insure a certain number of  
24 units are available, then we will have to take  
25 units out of service. There's no other way

1 around it.

2 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: Can I ask a question?  
3 Thank you. Now you said the County has a  
4 minimum of 11, and we have a minimum of 17  
5 level of service. Can you explain  
6 the difference?

7 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: The County has more.  
8 They probably have 50, 60, 80 units available.  
9 I don't know. But what I'm saying, remember,  
10 there was a countywide policy that said every  
11 municipality that wanted to provide fire and  
12 EMS service had to have 11 personnel on duty  
13 every day. So if you go to any fire department  
14 around here, they have to have a minimum of 11  
15 personnel. Now you can partner, but it has to  
16 be an automatic a type of event. But every  
17 municipality -- the intent of the level of  
18 service document was to say that no matter  
19 where you went in Palm Beach County or you  
20 traveled, that if you had an emergency, you  
21 would get the same level of service.

22 So the level of service standard says you  
23 have to have at least, you can do more, but you  
24 have to have at least 11 personnel on duty  
25 every day.

1 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: We have at least  
2 50 percent more --

3 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: We have 17 personnel on  
4 duty.

5 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: -- than the County  
6 requires?

7 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: Correct.

8 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: I'm trying to figure  
9 out, you know, why is that?

10 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: Because we believe we  
11 need them based on the call volume that we  
12 established. We have a call volume. We run a  
13 lot of calls. We do. We're a busy city.  
14 Regardless of how small we are, we have a high  
15 volume of calls and crucial calls. Very  
16 crucial call.

17 MAYOR MASTERS: Madam Chair.

18 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: One second. I just  
19 have a question. And then on top of this we  
20 have people on furlough.

21 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: That's correct.

22 MAYOR MASTERS: Chief, you said that  
23 the -- you would take a unit out -- you may  
24 have to take a unit out of service, correct?  
25 That's not the same thing as saying a station

1 may be closed. Those are two different things,  
2 right?

3 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: That's a good point.  
4 But if for some reason we fall below a certain  
5 level and if we had an engine that had to be  
6 taken out of service and a rescue truck, that  
7 could be considered an entire station. Now we  
8 would make every effort not to do that. But  
9 for me to sit here and say it can't happen, it  
10 could happen. But we'll do everything we can  
11 to prevent it. And if it's the council's  
12 policy to hold additional overtime, we'll do  
13 it. But at least you'll say here, it's okay  
14 chief to hold overtime to insure that we keep  
15 everything open.

16 MAYOR MASTERS: And if you take a unit out  
17 of service from one of the stations, does that  
18 mean that some of the units from the other  
19 stations would cover, would have to go to that  
20 area.

21 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: That's correct.

22 MAYOR MASTERS: So we would still be in  
23 service. It's just that one unit would be  
24 minus one unit at that particular station. I'm  
25 just trying to understand.

1 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I understand. For  
2 example, at fire station number two, if we take  
3 the rescue vehicle out of service for the day,  
4 then the next closest rescue vehicle would be  
5 from fire station number one here.

6 MAYOR MASTERS: Correct.

7 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: So they'll go over the  
8 tracks. Call comes in at Wells Recreation  
9 Center. Next closest unit will be fire station  
10 number three on Singer Island. They will come  
11 over. Call comes in over on Singer Island.  
12 Then now we got to find out where we're going  
13 to send the next rescue truck. The system will  
14 probably prompt a rescue truck from fire  
15 station number four all the way out on Military  
16 Trail. So it's a systematic type of process.  
17 It's redundant. The citizens of this community  
18 have access to every rescue truck in the City  
19 that we have available every day.

20 MAYOR MASTERS: Absolutely. So in other  
21 words, a rescue truck or a unit would be coming  
22 from somewhere?

23 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: Somewhere, correct.  
24 And when you don't have the personnel, there's  
25 a rescue truck or engine somewhere that will

1 not be staffed. It can't be, because you don't  
2 have enough bodies to put on it.

3 MAYOR MASTERS: Because I think that all  
4 of us -- well, I don't know about all of us,  
5 but from what I've heard. No one wants to see  
6 any station shut down period.

7 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: I understand. Neither  
8 do we.

9 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: This is the first  
10 time I heard that a station was going to be  
11 closed down. And I've gotten a call or two  
12 about that. You know, I just don't want to get  
13 people alarmed. Because those kind of orders  
14 come from this council. They just don't happen  
15 out in the streets. And this is the first you  
16 know --

17 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: Mr. Commissioner, last  
18 meeting when we submitted our paperwork and it  
19 was put out before council, I believe if you  
20 read the document it talks about reducing  
21 units. We put it in there and we outlined what  
22 would be the impact if you decided to cut  
23 additional personnel. So this is not the first  
24 time we've put it. And I'm not put it out  
25 there and saying we're closing a station. I'm

1 just saying if we don't have enough staffing to  
2 staff rescue trucks, it could eventually come  
3 to that if we decide as a City not to hold  
4 additional overtime to make sure we maintain a  
5 certain level of service. I'm not saying we're  
6 going to close it. That would be the last  
7 thing I would ever want to do. But I'm just  
8 saying if you don't have the bodies and you  
9 don't have the money, that's the only  
10 alternative that we do have in order to  
11 maintain service.

12 COUNCILPERSON BROOKS: Madam Chair.

13 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: Yes, Ms. Brooks.

14 COUNCILPERSON BROOKS: I'd like to know  
15 for the size of our City as compared with  
16 cities comparable to our size, how would you  
17 rank our fire department in terms of the amount  
18 of service we have to give as compared to other  
19 cities? I mean it seems that we are very busy.  
20 Do you have any comparisons of other  
21 municipalities, you know, with their fire  
22 rescue?

23 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: Well, the only other  
24 municipality that's our size and they don't  
25 provide the service anymore, and that's the

1 City of Lake Worth. But they don't provide the  
2 service anymore. But other than that, no, not  
3 around here. I think Mr. White did a study a  
4 while back, but he used you know cities  
5 internationally and did some comparison that he  
6 felt would be comparable to the City. But I'm  
7 just saying based on what we do on a daily  
8 basis, it's about what we have.

9 COUNCILPERSON BROOKS: Chief Perry, do you  
10 find that there's been an increase in the  
11 amount of service that's required in our City.

12 FIRE CHIEF PERRY: Well, to be honest with  
13 you, our call volume has decreased in years.  
14 Over the last couple of years we've gone down  
15 50 to 60 calls a year or something like that.  
16 But we're still -- now that takes into account  
17 we still have sometimes still even with the  
18 number of units we have now we still have to  
19 have mutual aid from West Palm or Palm Beach  
20 County, because we're busy. And at the same  
21 time if they need something, we provide the  
22 same level of service to them. So we stay  
23 steady. We're always in the five, 5,800, 6,000  
24 mark for calls. Never nothing below that as  
25 far as rescue calls and whatnot.

1 COUNCILPERSON BROOKS: Thank you.

2 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: I still have some  
3 questions in terms for the police also. I know  
4 that Ms. Jones said that the camera, the red  
5 light cameras, whatever. Is there -- the  
6 Chief, if you can, Harris, who would be then  
7 responsible for the operation and processing of  
8 those citations? How would that program -- how  
9 would that program affect the police department  
10 if we make additional cuts?

11 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: David Harris, Assistant  
12 Chief, Police Operations. I'm going to turn it  
13 over to Commander Madden. He did all the  
14 research on the red light camera project.

15 COMMANDER MADDEN: Mike Madden, Police  
16 Department. The red light cameras, most of the  
17 processes are done by a third party vender.  
18 The requirement on the police department would  
19 be to monitor -- well, to review each  
20 electronic citation, which would be a video of  
21 the violation, the tag and some still  
22 photographs, and certify it as a violation.  
23 Typically that would be probably one to two  
24 police officers doing that maybe for an hour a  
25 day.

1 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: What's the expected  
2 revenue that we can, you know, expect to  
3 realize with this program? At least give us an  
4 average.

5 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: Just FYI. Lake Worth  
6 just implemented this and they are estimating  
7 in their city a hundred thousand dollars.

8 COMMANDER MADDEN: We haven't selected a  
9 vendor. We did look at some preliminary  
10 information from one vendor. Putting cameras  
11 at four approaches at four different  
12 intersections, their estimate -- you know, we  
13 haven't had a chance to see if this is  
14 legitimate. They're trying to sell this to us.  
15 So we would get an independent opinion. With  
16 four approaches they showed an estimate of  
17 about 750,000 annually.

18 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: At four different  
19 intersections.

20 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: The problem with that  
21 theory is just like when we implemented the  
22 alarm protocol. You'd be fined for alarm.  
23 You're going to spike at the very beginning.  
24 In other words, we have four cameras up. As  
25 people get used and the word gets out, we'll

1 spike in the beginning. The violations will be  
2 sky high. And over a period of time they're  
3 going to level off probably drastically. See  
4 what it costs to move those cameras again and  
5 again.

6 So don't -- it's not -- what the company  
7 is saying, if they're saying 750,000, I can  
8 tell you that's not going to be every year.  
9 Because it's only common sense. If you get a  
10 ticket going through there once, maybe twice,  
11 but the third time you're going to stop at that  
12 red light. That's the problem with those  
13 systems.

14 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: The other thing I  
15 wanted to really dig into is I know that in  
16 this second round of cuts that we're just about  
17 losing our entire I don't want to say CSI  
18 Division, but our crime scene personnel. It's  
19 I believe an additional three out of four that  
20 would be gone. Can you speak to what will  
21 happen with our response time for a sworn  
22 officer to do what that unsworn personnel could  
23 do, and how would that affect our legal of  
24 service.

25 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: With part one crimes, which

1 is the more serious crimes, a regular police  
2 officer is not going to be able to do that  
3 crime scene. With the Chief, when we looked at  
4 it, that was the Chief's recommendation that we  
5 could still function with the one crime scene  
6 person. And then of course we have a sworn  
7 police officer who oversees that who does crime  
8 scene. We would process -- you know police  
9 officers are trained to process the minor  
10 scenes and that would just hold them up  
11 depending on the extent of the scene. Maybe 30  
12 minutes a scene to do. We do do a lot of crime  
13 scenes in the City.

14 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Has that department  
15 since we implemented it, has it not been an aid  
16 in helping solve a lot of these crimes that  
17 have been occurring.

18 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: Since we've had the  
19 additional personnel on, we haven't been on a  
20 year yet. So we really haven't done a study.  
21 But we have increased a tremendous amount of  
22 hits on latent prints.

23 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Okay. And in the  
24 second round, just so I'm clear, what else  
25 would we be losing? Do you know off the top of

1 your head? In the second round, what else  
2 would we be losing?

3 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: Code enforcement.

4 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: How many?

5 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: One.

6 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: One code  
7 enforcement officer.

8 CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: Is that a field  
9 position?

10 CITY MANAGER JONES: One code inspector  
11 position, two code technician positions, four  
12 police technician positions.

13 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: What is a code  
14 technician position? I've never heard of it.

15 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: They're processing the  
16 paperwork on the code violations. In other  
17 words, for the special magistrate to get those  
18 ready.

19 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: I see. Those are  
20 full-time positions?

21 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: Yes.

22 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: And we'll lose  
23 four --

24 CITY MANAGER JONES: Two code technicians,  
25 four police technicians.

1 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Police technicians.

2 And that's in the second round?

3 CITY MANAGER JONES: Yes, sir.

4 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Let me add. The  
5 first round was five police positions? Five  
6 sworn police positions?

7 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: Yes.

8 CITY MANAGER JONES: Yes.

9 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Which will bring  
10 our compliment to what?

11 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: I believe it's either 115  
12 or 117.

13 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: 115. And does that  
14 include like the Thousand Oaks and the Marsh  
15 Harbor, those contract positions?

16 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: Yes.

17 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: That includes  
18 those. If we take those out of our actual  
19 compliment, actual road patrol duties, I'm  
20 including the CR rail, we're down to about 112  
21 or something like that?

22 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: Probably about 110.

23 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: 110. And how many  
24 police officers do we normally -- just road  
25 patrol I'm speaking of do we service our city

1 with daily?

2 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: We staff a minimum of eight  
3 patrol officers.

4 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: With those cuts,  
5 how would that affect that staffing level?

6 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: We'll still be able to  
7 provide the eight officers, because we would  
8 move -- you know, I can't predict on a day if  
9 three or four people call in sick, we'd move  
10 the detectives to cover those positions.

11 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: But that would  
12 drastically increase the response time on  
13 something that's not in progress then?

14 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: Yes.

15 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Do you happen to  
16 know the level of response time for average  
17 call for maybe let's say something non-- well,  
18 let's say a fight without weapons. What's the  
19 average response time for something like that?

20 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: It's probably about five  
21 minutes. Between four and five minutes. We  
22 send our cars in a priority basis. In other  
23 words, if we have a shooting in progress or a  
24 person is shot, we have five officers who are  
25 doing reports, they're going to have to break.

1 It comes out as a priority level.

2 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Okay. I just want  
3 to make sure we're understanding where our  
4 level of service would go. I know our delayed  
5 calls, they can continue to get a higher  
6 response time that may not even be that same  
7 shift if it's a delayed burglary or something  
8 like that and we're running pretty busy. So  
9 what's the max response time that you think  
10 we'll get on a delayed burglary. Someone comes  
11 home and their house has been burglarized and  
12 they just come home from work and then get home  
13 around 5:30 or six. We're really busy at that  
14 time. What's an average time that they can  
15 expect to see an officer?

16 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: It's hard to say. Because,  
17 you know, it's just like the fire chief said, I  
18 don't want to put a response time. If it's a  
19 delayed burglary and we have a lot of emergency  
20 calls going, you know, we will call them and  
21 say as soon as we can get there. It could be  
22 an hour, two hours. It could really be up to  
23 three hours.

24 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: But a police  
25 technician can go and start processing that

1 scene and alleviate some of that issue with the  
2 sworn police. Since we're talking about  
3 cutting the police technicians, I'm just trying  
4 to show where they may be beneficial to making  
5 our legal of service a little bit better.

6 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: Well, the police technician  
7 responds to the crime scene part of it. They  
8 can respond and do the crime scene. But the  
9 reporting process has to be done by the  
10 officer.

11 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: By the officer.

12 Okay.

13 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: Can I ask a question?

14 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: You sure can.

15 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: Thank you. I'm  
16 concerned about the level of service in both  
17 police and the fire department. What I'm upset  
18 about is the point that we are always able to  
19 predict the worst, but we can't show what's  
20 actually happening. And that's a problem to me  
21 you know. You know, you can talk about what  
22 can happen if we don't do this. But, you know,  
23 you don't show what's really happening. And in  
24 my process, I use you know what's happened and  
25 what are you predicting, and look at the

1 situation and say well, you know, maybe we can  
2 cut this or maybe we can save this or maybe we  
3 can -- you know, why are we getting all these  
4 calls. Is the only way to solve them is to  
5 send more police officers out or some other  
6 form of addressing crime in the community. I'm  
7 trying to come up with alternatives and options  
8 and at the same time trying to save jobs. But  
9 there's more than one way to do that. And  
10 that's what I want the staff to do, to explore  
11 those different ways. And I don't see that. I  
12 don't see that coming from -- I don't see that  
13 coming from this administration. We haven't  
14 talked much about revenue. One of my next  
15 questions was going to be when we got back on  
16 the millage rate was how much revenue did we  
17 bring in? You know, it was mentioned that we  
18 bring in a million dollars worth of service  
19 from our contracts with the fire department.  
20 You know, how does that dictate? Are you  
21 factoring that in the budget, in their current  
22 budget, or if we're bringing in money, how much  
23 went in you know general revenue? How much do  
24 we have -- but you know I'm using all of those  
25 things to factor in my decision and try to make

1 it -- try to alleviate the pain.

2 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: I think with the contract  
3 services we've shown an innovative way to put  
4 more officers on with those communities paying  
5 for that service. We don't have to provide an  
6 officer to handle those calls.

7 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: Because they pay for  
8 themselves.

9 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: Exactly. In that case of  
10 an emergency, then those officers can be pulled  
11 out of there. The same when we had extra duty  
12 details. Those officers that sign up that the  
13 private industry is setting. We bring in money  
14 from that revenue in extra duty details. But  
15 they've dropped off drastically because people  
16 can't afford officers. But when we had those  
17 details, if there was an emergency call there,  
18 those officers could break from there and go.  
19 So we were putting more officers on the street.

20 As far as a breakdown of what happens,  
21 we're fully staffed. We're running traffic  
22 daily to enforce the speed laws for the safety  
23 out here on the major streets, etc. But when  
24 you drop that minimum, we haven't done a study  
25 on that. But, you know, there's programs that

1 will be affected when you cut officers. But  
2 will we still be able to provide a safety  
3 service, yes, we will.

4 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: That's a good  
5 statement. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: Mayor Masters.

7 MAYOR MASTERS: Chief, how many officers  
8 have been hired, added to the police department  
9 over the last few years, seven years, three or  
10 four years?

11 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: I think with the contracts  
12 probably about 20 I would say.

13 MAYOR MASTERS: And you would take that  
14 back three years, four years, or what?

15 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: I take that back seven.

16 MAYOR MASTERS: During those seven years  
17 or now, would you say that the crime rate as we  
18 have added officers, would the crime rate has  
19 increased or decreased?

20 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: In the last couple of years  
21 it's decreased.

22 MAYOR MASTERS: So what about the other  
23 five years?

24 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: I'd have to go back and look  
25 at those stats.

1           MAYOR MASTERS: I guess what I'm asking  
2           you is there any data that suggests increasing  
3           officers -- increasing officers decreases crime  
4           in the community? Do we have any correlation  
5           one way or the other?

6           ASST CHIEF HARRIS: Well, if you're looking  
7           the crime rate dropping, there's many factors  
8           that go into it. One, there's more officers on  
9           the street. So we're utilizing different ways  
10          through traffic enforcement, etc. And, you  
11          know, most crimes are committed by people using  
12          vehicles. So if you know you're going to use a  
13          lot of officers out running traffic, you're  
14          going to get stopped, you have less --  
15          hopefully the criminals have a less chance of  
16          coming here. But what's hard to judge is I  
17          have four county parks in the City of Riviera  
18          Beach. October the Sheriff pulls all the park  
19          police out of there and they'll be staffed by  
20          the counties district. Now some days those  
21          parks won't have police officers in there.  
22          Deputy Sheriffs, if something happens there,  
23          I'm going to have to respond. It's the same  
24          with the VA clinic. If an emergency happens  
25          there, they don't have adequate staff, we have

1 to respond. Same with the Port of Palm Beach.  
2 If an emergency happens there, we have to  
3 respond.

4 So it's hard to judge a crime rate, you  
5 know, with that. That's why we set our  
6 staffing at a minimum of eight officers have to  
7 be on a shift. And we feel confident with  
8 those eight officers that we can provide  
9 service.

10 MAYOR MASTERS: And just to digress, but  
11 yet to be on point. It's very shameful that  
12 the VA Hospital is still using West Palm Beach  
13 as their address and yet we respond. I mean it  
14 has nothing to do with you or the department,  
15 but it's just shameful and it's really not  
16 acceptable.

17 But back to our point and to be on point.  
18 I don't think anyone would want to see any  
19 officers cut, and that's why I asked that  
20 question, especially if it's going to have an  
21 impact on public safety. But as you say, you  
22 know, there's other things that have impact.  
23 It's not necessarily cutting officers, cutting  
24 one or two officers may not have an impact on  
25 public safety because you do a lot of

1 innovative -- you got technology. You got a  
2 lot of other things that may kind of balance  
3 that. Would you say that?

4 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: Correct. I don't  
5 want to lose any police officers.

6 MAYOR MASTERS: I don't either.

7 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: But I'm a policy follower.

8 So when we've laid out our next group of cuts,  
9 that's what we thought we could get through  
10 with and still provide adequate safety. I  
11 don't want to lose any officers. But if I have  
12 to lose officers, we're going with the plan  
13 that the Chief laid out. And we feel with that  
14 plan we can effectively serve the public.

15 MAYOR MASTERS: My final question, and we  
16 know that the Chief is very creative and very  
17 innovative and has done an outstanding job as  
18 well as you in assisting him in bringing about  
19 a great deal of public safety. I'm so proud of  
20 our department and our city with the juvenile  
21 curfew, that not one young person as you know,  
22 not one young person has been shot or killed  
23 during the curfew hours in our city in almost  
24 three years. And that you're to be commended  
25 for that.

1           But let me ask you this. Is it possible  
2 that we might be able to expand some of the  
3 duties of the Citizens On Patrol to help out in  
4 those areas from keeping a police officer to  
5 respond like some of the other cities have kind  
6 of done. They've given them some other duties.

7           ASST CHIEF HARRIS: The Citizens On Patrol,  
8 they can only patrol and call in calls. We  
9 don't want to give them anymore duties because  
10 it's a safety factor. Will we take more  
11 citizens to be in that program? Absolutely.  
12 You know, they're driving around. They're more  
13 eyes. But as far as giving them any type of  
14 duties as far as, you know, getting involved in  
15 anything, absolutely not.

16           MAYOR MASTERS: What about parking  
17 tickets?

18           ASST CHIEF HARRIS: No. No.

19           CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: I'm sorry. I have a  
20 question. A.C. Harris, you talked about the  
21 review regarding the red light cameras, that it  
22 would take one to two police officers who would  
23 review the stills and the footage or maybe it  
24 was Commander Madden. Isn't there also a  
25 component in that where the citations have to

1 be mailed out to individuals?

2 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: The third party does that.

3 CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: So there's also a  
4 cost associated to whatever revenue that's  
5 going to have to be taken off the top, right?  
6 And I don't want to get too far down into it.  
7 But that --

8 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: Correct.

9 CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: Okay. All right.  
10 All right. That's all I have for now.

11 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: On the traffic  
12 camera. When did you guys get your last  
13 proposals? Was it before the new state law or  
14 after?

15 COMMANDER MADDEN: It was after the state  
16 legislation.

17 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: One more question.  
18 I remember I think it was Juno Beach had to  
19 return a lot of money. Has that issue been  
20 cleared up to where we're going to be fine?

21 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: The state law cleared it  
22 up.

23 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Okay. Thanks  
24 Chief.

25 MAYOR MASTERS: Chief, one more question.

1 The grant that we just got from the U.S.  
2 Justice Department with 270,000. I read that.  
3 Klein. We met with them several months ago.  
4 He wrote us and said that we were able to get  
5 that. Do you know how much that was?

6 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: No, I don't. I'm sorry.

7 MAYOR MASTERS: Do you know what that  
8 money is being used for? Does anybody know?  
9 We just recently -- you guys just recently got  
10 it.

11 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: Technology, correct?

12 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: Yeah, it's technology.

13 ASST CHIEF HARRIS: Technology grant.

14 COMMANDER MADDEN: We have some leeway in  
15 it, but it's mainly technology. Not personnel,  
16 but technology equipment.

17 MAYOR MASTERS: But you did get quite a  
18 bit though. Good.

19 CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: One last thing Madam  
20 Chair. Mrs. Jones, have you directed staff at  
21 all to look at ways that we can move forward  
22 with putting parking meters along the beach? I  
23 don't know if it would be feasible or not to do  
24 it right now at Newcomb Hall or the marina.  
25 But have you started looking at that at all?

1 Okay. Good.

2 CITY MANAGER JONES: Yes, we have for both  
3 locations.

4 CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: Okay. Good. You  
5 know and one other thing I brought up once  
6 before is liter in the City. I remember when I  
7 was a kid, you know, driving along the highway  
8 with my family. You see the signs out, \$500  
9 for littering. And my mom would about break my  
10 hand off if I even thought about throwing  
11 something out the window. And I just think  
12 that -- and I saw something on the news of some  
13 city that had started doing that. But it was  
14 with the focus being on like fast food wrappers  
15 and things like that.

16 So I'm looking at -- I'm thinking rather  
17 how can we -- how can we start something like  
18 that in our city where, you know, concerning  
19 littering? You know, especially if we see  
20 somebody throwing stuff, you know, on our  
21 highways. Well, it's certainly not being  
22 enforced, you know. I don't remember it coming  
23 off the books. But I thought it was gone  
24 because you saw no more signs and it's  
25 certainly not being enforced in our city. And

1 I'm not one to say, you know, we want to just  
2 continue to beat people up, you know. But I'm  
3 also looking at ways that we can, you know,  
4 assist in cleaning up our city, you know. So  
5 that's just something for you to think about.

6 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: Just to expand on  
7 that. I think it would be a good idea. I know  
8 our police go into the schools. You know, we  
9 go into the schools. And, you know, we should  
10 take a minute or so and mention that. Yep,  
11 mention it to the children. You know,  
12 something like that should really start at  
13 home. Like you said your mother. Right. And  
14 I'm sure a lot of us went through that also.  
15 So really, you know, that's something that you  
16 should learn at home. And if you don't learn  
17 it at home, at least the schools can talk about  
18 it.

19 So again you know all of the elected  
20 officials are always in the schools along with  
21 a lot of our employees. So maybe, you know, we  
22 can do that. We can take a minute or so and  
23 mention that to the kids.

24 All right. Anything else from the  
25 council? Anything else. Ms. Jones.

1 CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: Are we going over  
2 the special utility district?

3 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: No. We're having a  
4 meeting for the millage. Move to adopt the  
5 millage.

6 CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: Second.

7 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: At what?

8 CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: What's being  
9 proposed.

10 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Will somebody say  
11 it please.

12 CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: At five point --

13 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: No, not quite that  
14 low.

15 CITY MANAGER JONES: 8.9980.

16 CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: 8.9980. I'll  
17 second.

18 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: All right. Madam  
19 Clerk.

20 THE CLERK: Madam Chair, I'm going to read  
21 the heading of the resolution for the record.

22 A resolution of the City Council of the  
23 City of Riviera Beach, Palm Beach County,  
24 Florida setting the maximum millage rate for  
25 fiscal year 2010/2011 at a rate of 8.9980 mills

1 and provide an effective date.

2 Councilperson Lowe.

3 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: Yes.

4 THE CLERK: Councilperson Brooks.

5 COUNCILPERSON BROOKS: Yes.

6 THE CLERK: Councilperson Thomas.

7 COUNCILPERSON THOMAS: Yes.

8 THE CLERK: Chair Pro Tem Davis.

9 CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS: Yes.

10 THE CLERK: Chair Pardo.

11 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: No.

12 THE CLERK: That motion is approved with  
13 Councilperson Pardo dissenting.

14 CHAIRPERSON PARDO: Okay. Thank you. Do  
15 you want to take a five minute recess?

16 COUNCILPERSON LOWE: Move to adjourn to  
17 end this meeting.

18 (Thereupon, the videotaped proceedings  
19 concluded at 7:15 p.m.)

20

21

22

23

24

25

CERTIFICATE

STATE OF FLORIDA )  
COUNTY OF PALM BEACH )

I, TRACY LYN FAZIO, Court Reporter and Notary Public within and for the State of Florida at Large, duly commissioned and qualified, do hereby certify that pursuant to a notice to transcribe said videotaped proceedings, the examination was reduced to writing under my supervision; and that the transcript is a true record of my stenographic notes.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and affixed my official seal this 11th day of July, 2011.

\_\_\_\_\_  
TRACY LYN FAZIO  
Court Reporter and  
Notary Public, State of  
Florida at Large

**APPROVED:**

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
**THOMAS A. MASTERS**  
MAYOR

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
**JUDY L. DAVIS**  
CHAIRPERSON

**ATTEST:**

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
**CARRIE E. WARD**  
MASTER MUNICIPAL CLERK  
CITY CLERK

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
**BILLIE E. BROOKS**  
CHAIR PRO-TEM

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
**CEDRICK A. THOMAS**  
COUNCILPERSON

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
**DAWN S. PARDO**  
COUNCILPERSON

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
**SHELBY L. LOWE**  
COUNCILPERSON

**MOTIONED BY:** B. BROOKS

**SECONDED BY:** D. PARDO

**B. BROOKS** AYE

**J. DAVIS** AYE

**C. THOMAS** AYE

**D. PARDO** AYE

**S. LOWE** AYE

REVIEWED AS TO LEGAL SUFFICIENCY

-----  
PAMALA HANNA RYAN, CITY ATTORNEY

DATE: \_\_\_\_\_